M.R.O. 1—77,006—8-6-37.

(1) Number of pages

(2) Date of repair

(3) Initials of the Referencer

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE.

Government of Madras.

Public Works DEPARTMENT.

G.O. No. 451,452	2048	Press / Mis.
Dated	27 8	1872.

Not to be folded or roughly handled

16

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Public Works Department,
27th August 1872.

No. 451. Read the following letter from the Superintending Engineer, 8th Division, to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated Madura, 2nd August 1872, No. 2,136:—

I HAVE the honour to report, for the information of Government, that Captain J. Pennycuick, R.E., Executive Engineer, has represented to me that the regular work of the Dindigul Range occupies quite as much of his time as the Government can well claim from a Range Officer; and that the additional* work "thrown upon him by the supervision of the proceedings in connection with the Perryaur project can only be done by an amount of labour much beyond what an officer under ordinary circumstances can reasonably be expected to undergo."

* *Vide* G. O. No. 1,519, dated 20th June 1872.

2. Under these circumstances, Captain Pennycuick considers that he is justified in asking what additional remuneration the Government propose to allow him on this account.

3. I need scarcely mention that the Dindigul Range has been recently enlarged* by the addition thereto of the Tiroomungalum Taluq. And considering that Captain Pennycuick will have to perform not only the ordinary range duties, but also that of supervising the Perryaur project work, I am of opinion that it is but equitable that that officer should receive additional remuneration for the increased work thus devolving upon him.

* G. O. No. 1,586, dated 1st July 1872.

4. I think it only my duty to point out that Captain Pennycuick feels most keenly the want of consideration evinced, in his opinion, towards him in Major Mullins' Note printed with G. O. 4th May 1871, No. 1,236.

5. Few officers who have gone home on sick leave have devoted so considerable a portion of that leave, as five months, to the elaboration of a Government project, and still fewer, I imagine, have reaped less advantage from the same, than Captain Pennycuick has done. For it must be borne in mind that for devoting for the period above named his best abilities, which at least are not inconsiderable, to the elaboration of this project, he received from Government a rebuke which could scarcely have been stronger had he neglected their interests altogether, and remained idle during the interval in question.

6. You are well aware that I speak quite disinterestedly on this subject, as at the period in question I was not in any way connected with the district, but it cannot be wrong in me, on this occasion, to let the Government know what painful feelings were excited at the time in the breasts of all independent officers who have read that order, and the regret which they experienced in that the Government whom they have always been accustomed to look up to for the kind and impartial consideration of their claims should pass an order which would probably have the effect of damping in future all enthusiasm in the service on the part of their Engineer Officers at home on sick leave.

7. I trust that I shall be excused the liberty of mentioning this subject, and that it will be quite understood that I do so in no captious spirit. The matter has been represented to me by Captain Pennycuick with the special view that the

Government will be pleased to take the circumstances in question into consideration when determining what remuneration they will be disposed to pass to him for the extra work thrown upon him in connection with the Perryaur project works.

No. 452. ORDER THEREON, 27th August 1872, No. 2,043.

ESTABLISHMENT, No. 19.

HIS Excellency the Governor in Council observes that the Goodaloor Ghaut is not being undertaken in connection with the Perryaur project, as erroneously supposed by Lieutenant-Colonel Roberts and Captain Pennycuick, but is being carried out from Provincial Funds in fulfilment of a pledge given by the Government of Madras to co-operate with that of Travancore in opening a direct line of communication between the Madura District and the Western Coast. Hence the work on which Lieutenant Greer is engaged is within the category of ordinary works, such as a Range Officer is generally understood to be competent to supervise, when the services of an able Assistant have been placed at his disposal for its execution. In the event of the Perryaur project being sanctioned the work will be assigned to a special officer; it was never intended that its superintendence should form part of the duties of the Range Officer.

2. The Government regret to learn that Captain Pennycuick has been discouraged by the terms of Major Mullins' Memorandum and of the orders passed thereon by Government. The Governor in Council highly appreciates the zeal and ability invariably displayed by Captain Pennycuick and especially in connection with the Perryaur project.

(True Extract.)

Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Government.

To the Superintending Engineer, 8th Division.
,, Acting Chief Engineer for Irrigation.

Exd. S. T. Austin.

31

Superintd. Engineer's Office 8th Dn.

No. 2136

Madura 2nd August 1872.

From,

Lieutenant Colonel R. A. Roberts R.E.

Superintending Engineer 8th Dn.

To,

Colonel G. W. Walker R.E.

Secretary to Government P.W.D.

Madras.

Sir,

I have the honor to report, for the information of Government that Captain J. Pennycuick R.E. Executive Engineer has represented to me that the regular work of the Dindigul Range occupies quite as much of his time as the Government can well claim from a Range Officer, and that the additional work "thrown upon "him by the supervision of the proceedings "in connection with the Perryaur Project, "can only be done by an amount of labor

x Vide G.O. No. 1519 dated 20th June 1872.

much

much beyond what an officer under ordinary circumstances can reasonably be expected to undergo."–

2. Under these circumstances Captain Pennycuick considers that he is justified in asking what additional remuneration the Government propose to allow him on this account.–

3. I need scarcely mention that the Dindigul Range has been recently enlarged by the addition thereto of the Tiroomungalum Talook. And considering that Captain Pennycuick will have to perform not only the ordinary Range duties, but also that of supervising the Perryaur Project work, I am of opinion that it is but equitable that that Officer should receive additional remuneration

× G.O. No 158 dated 1st July

for

2
50

for the increased work thus devolving upon him.-

4. I think it only my duty to poin[t] out that Captain Pennycuick feels most keenly the want of consideration evinced, in his opinion, towards him, in Major Mullins's Note printed with G. O. 4th May 1871, No 1236.-

5. Few Officers who have gone hom[e] on sick leave have devoted so considerab[le] a portion of that leave, as 5 months, to t[he] elaboration of a Government project, an[d] still fewer, I imagine, have reaped less advantage from the same, than Captai[n] Pennycuick has done.- For it must be borne in mind that for devoting for th[e] period above named his best abilities which at least are not inconsiderable

to

to the elaboration of this project, he received from Government a rebuke which could scarcely have been stronger had he neg:lected their interests altogether, and remained idle during the interval in question. –

6. You are well aware that I speak quite disinterestedly on this subject, as at the period in question I was not in any way connected with the District, but it cannot be wrong in me, on this occasion, to let the Government know what painful feelings were excited at the time in the breasts of all independent officers who have read that order, and the regret which they experienced in that the Government whom they have ~~to~~ always been accustomed to look up to

for

for the kind and impartial consideration of their claims should pass an order which would probably have the effect of damping in future all enthusiasm in the service, on the part of their Engineer Officers at home on sick leave.—

7. I trust that I shall be excused the liberty of mentioning this subject, and that it will be quite understood that I do so in no captious spirit. The matter has been represented to me by Captain Pennycuick with the special view that the Government will be pleased to take the circumstances in question into consideration, when determining what remuneration, they will be disposed to pass to him for the extra work thrown upon him in connection with the

Perryaur

Perryaur Project works.—

I have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your Most Obedt. Servt.

Richd. A. Roberts Lieut. Colo. R.E.

Superintg. Engineer 8th Dn.

Compd

S.E.

P. W. 1872 [illegible]
Fm Procgs of Govt [illegible] August No 3779.
The Supt. Engineer
8: Division

To
The Secretary to Govt.
D. P. W.
Marine.

Dated 2nd
Recd 5th } August /72

Brings to notice certain facts of Captain Pennycuick's services, & recommends that the remuneration asked for may be granted for the extra duties in connection with the Periyaur Project —

No. 2042. 27 Augt /72.

Ret 581

Refd to Coby 5 Aug /72

11a

I have always heard Capt Pennycuick spoken of in high terms, as a zealous & able officer - & I should regret that aught should be done or said to discourage or pain him - At the same time there is a limit beyond which officers - how-ever meritorious - cannot be suffered to go - and I think that in this matter both Capt Pennycuick & Col Roberts have transgressed that limit.

In the first instance Capt P. has represented to the Sub: Engr that the ordinary work of the Dindigul range occupies quite as much of his time as the pub. can well claim - and that the additional work lately thrown on him. By

the general supervision of the foot-along ghaut-trace. Survey & Estimates - (the Joint Secr. R.E. an able officer) "can only be done by an amount of labor much beyond what an officer under ordinary circumstances can reasonably be expected to undergo". Had Capt P. stopped here, and adduced arguments & facts in support of his assertion, no fault could have been found with him. But unfortunately he goes on to ask what extra remuneration he is to receive for this extra work! This is the ~~this~~ age of "Strikes" & here we have the principle in its integrity - the employé determines - off-hand - what is a fair day's work for his wage and

demands payment for all in Excess! 130

Now, I submit, that no officer – however able or zealous or meritorious – should be suffered to do an act like this without rebuke.

As regards the order of Govt. of 4 May 71. I readily confess my wish now that some more hearty acknowledgement of Capt. P.'s work had been made in it. but I cannot go the length of admitting that it is unjust – or afforded grounds of complaint. Capt. P. _at his own wish_, was entrusted with the task of elaborating the scheme – and received very precise instructions. He saw fit to set these aside – and worked out a scheme of his own! Major Mullins did no more than his duty in pointing out that it was Capt P's "first duty to design

& estimate for the works in accordance with his instructions: any suggestions he might have added would have received every attention". This seems to me a dictum which cannot be disputed - and Capt P: has only himself to thank for the result. which Major M. thus summarises - "As it is, after waiting many months, some of the information expected has not been furnished but, in lieu of it, something which was not wanted, has been given". Capt P's was an instance of misguided zeal. for which he had no right to expect pity to be pitiful. He "worked out a scheme differing materially from that required - (and) by so doing much reduced the value of his labors". As I said before I wish that Pit. had dwelt more on his labors and less on his mistake. but this is

150

2/ far from admitting that he has been
valid ground of complaint
against Col. or Major McMurdo -
The G.O. if I recollect rightly - was
hatched in Council, after considerable
conversation between Lord Dalhousie
& Col Cumberlege.
Col Baker's own remarks on
the subject seem to me as placidly
impertinent as any I have seen
come across! He is careful to be
so that he is quite disinterested
he interposes as "amicus curiae" much
like the Chorus in a Greek play - &

"more in sorrow than in anger" reads
as a homily on the [illegible] attempt
on the Cortes of the Emp^r. of an order
issued more than a year ago. It
was quite competent for Capt. P.
to remonstrate against the order
as it related to him. But I can
not conceive any possible ground
of justification for Col. Herbert's
interference. Much less for
the tone & spirit of his remon-
strance. I think the Gov^t. will
be culpably regardless of its
dignity, if it allows such con-

Govt. to have been censured.

Considering that at least 2 years will elapse before the Periyar project can be undertaken, I do not think it advisable that Govt. should now pledge itself to entrust the work to any particular officer. It will be enough to say that when undertaken it will form the charge of a [illegible] special officer.

L. O. S.

[illegible]
45 x 52
[illegible] 72

Memorandum

With reference to the question of supervision of the Periyaur Project, when sanctioned, the Chief Engineer Department Public Works considers it necessary to bring to the notice of Government that Captain Pennycuick has never been connected with the Periyaur Project as remodelled by Mr R Smith. The project with which Captain Pennycuick was connected was that of a Dam on a totally different site from that discovered by Mr R. Smith, and the outlet for the Irrigation Water has had to be changed with the Reservoir and Dam site. In Colonel Walker's opinion the failure to

fise upon the correct site during the first years of exploration, from 1867 to 1870, was rather a blot on the management of the Works.

Lieutenant Speer was senior Officer under Mr. Smith throughout the 2nd Series of explorations and Projects and is spoken of in Mr. Smith's report in the highest terms.

Under these circumstances, and considering the resentment still shown by Captain Penny:cuick at Lieut. Coll. Mullins strictures, Coll. Walker as Chief Engineer of the Public Works Deptt. cannot recommend the Government to commit themselves now to any

pledge

pledge that Captain Pennycuick
shall at some future indefinite
time have consigned to him the
charge of a Project, with working
out the details of which he has
had nothing to do.

Ootacamund
August/72

G. M. Walker Col. R.E.
Chief Engineer D.P.W.

[redacted]

I cannot concur in any part of this draft. I am under a strong impression that it has all along been understood that Captain Pennycuick should in the event of the Periyar project being sanctioned be entrusted with the execution of the ~~work~~ project to which he has devoted much time & labor. He is a very able officer, thoroughly devoted to his duty and is deserving of every encouragement from the Government. To supersede him, as

His Excellency the Governor in Council learns from this letter that the enlargement of the Dindigul Range, recommended by the Superintending Engineer 8th Dn, and approved in G. O. No. 1586 of 1st July 1872 has increased the regular work of that Range to such an extent that it occupies quite as much of the Range

25a

Officer's time as the Government can well claim from him, and that Captain Pennycuick is not disposed to exercise such general supervision over the Trace and Survey and estimate of the Goodaloor Ghaut as was required of him in G.O. No. 1579 of 20th June, without extra remuneration. -

The Governor in Council observes that the Goodaloor Ghaut is not being undertaken in connection with the Periyaur Project, as erroneously supposed by Lieutt. Col. Roberts and Captain Pennycuick, but is being carried out from Provincial Funds in fulfilment of a pledge made by the Govt. of Madras to cooperate with that of Travancore in opening a direct line of communication between the Madura District and the Western Coast. Hence the work on which Lieutt. Green is engaged is within the category of ordinary works, such

as

is here proposed, by entrusting this important work to a junior officer, would, in my opinion, be, to say the least, a very harsh proceeding. If I am not very much mistaken, it will be impossible for any officer however able & zealous, to carry out the Periyaur works in addition to the charge of a Range. The proper course, it appears to me will be, when the Periyaur scheme is sanctioned, (if it ever is), to relieve Captain Pennycuick of his range and ~~[illegible]~~ require him to devote himself exclusively to the Periyaur works. -

I would now simply inform Colonel Roberts that the Ghaut is not being undertaken in connection with the Periyaur project and that the general supervision of the work on which Lt. Green is engaged in connexion with that Ghaut is not more than the Officer in charge of the Range may reasonably be expected to undertake, but in the event of the Periyaur project being sanctioned the work will be assigned to a special officer & that it is the intention of the Govt. to select Captain Pennycuick for the duty, and that it would not be intended that the superintendence of the Periyaur work should form part of the duties of the Range Officer.

I would add that the Govt. regret to learn that Captain Pennycuick has been discouraged by the terms of Major Walker's memorandum & of the orders passed thereon by Govt.; & that the Governor in Council highly appreciates the zeal & ability displayed by Capt. P. in connexion with the Periyaur project.

as a Range Officer is generally understood to be competent to supervise, when the services of an able Assistant have been placed at his disposal for its execution –

The Governor in Council ~~therefore~~ is not disposed to acquiesce in the most unusual and, he cannot but add, most un:becoming, demand for extra remuneration made by Captain Pennycuick and supported by Lieut Coll Roberts; and as it appears further from

~~is therefore unable to accede to the~~

~~I would then add all the passage which have made~~

My feeling is that the Govt. is to blame for having allowed an order to go out as to [illegible] remuneration, which was, of necessity, most discouraging & disappointing to an officer who had devoted his time & his talents & had sacrificed his health to the work, on which moreover he had employed a considerable portion of his leave in England. I regard

the letter under review, that Captain Pennycuick still bitterly resents the animadversions on his proceedings with reference to the preparation of the first Periyaur Project, made by the Chief Engineer for Irrigation on which was based Govt. Order No. 1236 of 4th May 1871, he has come to the conclusion that it will not be desirable that that Officer should be employed in carrying out the revised Project when sanctioned

× Lt Col. Roberts' remarks are substantially just and I entertain a strong conviction that unless the former & are more careful especially in the Public Works Dept. in treating their officers with that consideration which every hardworking public servant is entitled the result will be a feeling of universal discouragement and the necessary consequence in different work.

A.J.

Under the circumstances stated by the Consultant in the foregoing Memorandum, I agree with him as to the course which it is desirable to pursue in this case. Harsh and inconsiderate

sanctioned. It seems hopeless to expect that he will work at it in such cordial cooperation with the head of the Irrigation branch of the Public Works Deptt under whose direct orders he would be placed, as is essentially necessary. His Lordship in Council accordingly resolves to entrust the execution not only of the Goodaloor Ghaut Works, but of the Perryaur Project when sanctioned, to Lieutt Greer who (it has been ascertained from Mr R Smith who elaborated

that

treatment, whether in matter or in manner of public functionaries is prejudicial to the authority of the Govt and to the interests of the public service.

[illegible]

that Project) is tho=
=roughly acquainted
with its every detail,
and may be safely en=
=trusted with its charge
Lieutt Green will
carry on his present
duties in connection
with the Ghaut, in
direct communication
with the Supg: Engr 8th
Dn and his future
duties in connection
with the Periyaur Pro
ject in similar com
munication with the
Chief Engineer for Irrgn.

~~Kept with the~~
~~the amended~~
~~[illegible] Draft~~

The Governor in
Council cannot concur
with Lt Coll. Roberts
in the view that he
puts

puts forward of his
own action in this matter
As towards the Govt.
he is serving, it is
presumptuous and
insubordinate; as
towards Officers
serving under him it
is injudicious in the
extreme - He cannot
suppose that many
other Officers will
agree in Lieut. Coll.
Roberts view of the
wording of the Govt.
order last quoted, and
regards it as clear
evidence of how little
that Officer is himself

31a

qualified for the higher and more responsible posts of the Government service, in which his indiscreet action and language are calculated to act on those under him with most mischievous effect — G.W.W.

higher and more

favorable facts o

Government are

in which the

nation and foreign

are calculated to

in three grades by

with ... nations

were connected with the

Captain

[illegible]

Fair copy

His Excellency
the Governor in Council
observes that the
Goodaloor Ghaut is
not being undertaken
in connection with
the Perryaur Project,
as erroneously sup-
-posed by Lieutenant
Colonel Roberts and
Captain Pennycuick,
but is being carried

out from Provincial
Funds in fulfilment
of a pledge ~~made~~ given by
the Government of Madras
to cooperate with that
of Travancore in
opening a direct line
of communication
between the Madura
District and the
Western Coast. Hence
the work on which
Lieutenant Greer
is engaged is within
the category of ordinary
works, such as a Range
officer is generally
understood to be
competent to super-
-vise, when the services

35

of an able Assistant
have been placed
at his disposal for
its execution.

Same pon. ~~####~~ In the event of the
Perryaur Project
being sanctioned
the work will be
assigned to a special
Officer; ~~and it is the
intention of Govt. to
select Captain
Pennycuick for the
duty, but~~ it was
never intended
that ~~the~~ its superintendence
~~of the Perryaur work~~
should form part

~~See Memorandum
accompanying -
Gumm~~

of ~~his~~ the duties ~~as a~~ 1 the

Range Officer.

The Government regret to learn that Captain Pennycuick has been discouraged by the terms of Major Mullins' Memorandum and of the order passed thereon by Government.

The Governor in Council highly appreciates the zeal and ability invariably displayed by Capt: Pennycuick & especially in connection with the Perryaur Project.

G.M.W.

P.W. Progs. July 1872 O.S. 2003.

167

Supt. Engr. 8th Dn.
Ch. Engr. for Irrig.

No. 2043. P.W.D. 370

Pro. of the Madras Govt.

Read the following :-

From the Supg. Engr. offg. 8th Dn. — } H.E. No. 37/2136 of E Aug

His Excellency the Governor in Council observes ~~that~~ the Goodaloor Ghaut is not being undertaken in connection with the Perryaur Project as erroneously supposed by Lieutenant Colonel Robets and Captain Pennycuick, but is being carried out from Provincial Funds in fulfilment of a pledge given by the Government of Madras to cooperate with ~~that~~ of Travancore in opening a direct line

of communication between
the Madura District
and the Western Coast
Hence the work on
which Lieutenant Green
is engaged is within
the category of ordinary
Works, such as a Range
Officer is generally
understood to be com
petent to supervise,
when the services of
an able Assistant
have been placed at
his disposal for its
execution. In the
event of the Periyaur
Project being sanctioned
the work will be assigned
to a special Officer;
it was never intended

398

that its superintendence should form part of the duties of the Range Officer.

The Government regret to learn that Captain Pennycuick has been discouraged by the terms of Major Mullins' Memorandum and of the Orders passed thereon by Government. The Governor in Council highly appreciates the zeal and ability invariably displayed by Captn. Pennycuick and especially in connection with the Periyar Project.

G.M.W.

Desp. 2/9/72

28
3

6 Engr. 8 Divl.
5 Chief Engr. for Irrgn.

42a No 3779

Govt. of {1872} Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

To The Superintending Engr.
8th Division

Dated

Recd. Encl.

G. O. 27th augt 1872, No. 2043.

Nos. 451–452

Capt. Pennycuick R.E.

Passing orders on letter from ~~Capt.~~ the Supg. Engr. of the 8th Dn. recommending the grant to Capt Pennycuick of a remuneration for the additional work devolving on him in the superintendence of the Perryaur Project.